



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

GOHEBIAETH YN DILYN CYFARFOD Y PWYLLGOR

Pwyllgor PWYLLGOR CRAFFU AMGYLCHEDDOL

Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod DYDD MAWRTH, 5 MEHEFIN 2018, 4.30 PM

Gweler isod gohebiaeth anfon gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar ôl y cyfarfod , ynghyd ag unrhyw ymatebion a gafwyd

Am unrhyw fanylion pellach, cysylltwch â scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

12 **Gohebiaeth yn dilyn y cyfarfod pwyllgor** (*Tudalennau 3 - 16*)

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Ref: RDB/RP/MM/05.06.2018

08 June 2018

Councillor Michael Michael,
Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Michael,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 5 June 2018

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 5 June 2018. As you are aware the meeting received items titled 'Shared Regulatory Service – Business Plan 2018/19 & Annual Report 2017/18' and 'Cabinet Response to Restore Our Rivers'. The comments and observations made by Members following these items are set out in this letter.

Shared Regulatory Service – Business Plan 2018/19 & Annual Report 2017/18

- The Committee is pleased with the progress that the Shared Regulatory Service has achieved in the last twelve months and the proposals contained within its business plan for 2018/19. In particular Members feel that the service has done well to deliver its role within budget and to score well against the vast majority of performance indicators. On behalf of the Committee I would like to thank the Shared Regulatory Service for their hard work and the progress that they have made in 2017/18.
- Members noted the twelve redundancies that are required from the service to meet its budget savings for the financial year 2019/20. They were concerned that the redundancies could have a negative impact on service delivery and will closely monitor the effect that this will have on service

delivery in the next few years. In addition to this, I would be grateful if you could confirm the cost full financial cost of the redundancies.

- During the meeting I asked a question about how the other two partner local authorities had scrutinised the Shared Regulatory Service and if there were any future plans for joint scrutiny of the service. It was clear that existing scrutiny arrangements were specific to individual authorities and that a workable joint scrutiny approach has yet to be achieved. As Chair of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would be willing to engage in some form of joint scrutiny with the other partner local authorities; this I believe would potentially help prevent duplication of scrutiny and ensure that the service is thoroughly scrutinised from the perspective of each of the partner local authorities. Several Members of the Committee felt that some type of joint scrutiny pilot could be explored. I would be grateful if you could raise the topic of joint scrutiny at the next Shared Regulatory Service Joint Committee meeting and then provide the Committee with feedback resulting from the discussion.
- At the meeting Members raised some concerns about the Trading Standards performance indicator result 'SRS/TS/002' that was risk rated as either 'Red' or 'Amber' across each of the partner local authority areas in 2017/18. Shared Regulatory Service officers commented that this was both a frustrating and misleading indicator for the service as any new cases opened towards the end of the financial year needed to be completed before the end of that financial year. If such cases weren't completed very quickly then they would count against the performance of the service. The Committee agreed with the Shared Regulatory Service officers and felt that it should be possible to develop a better indicator that didn't focus on completion by a single date. For example, if a very complex case arose in mid-March that would ordinarily take six months to resolve it would seem stupid to penalise the service for failing to deal with it in two weeks. In addition to this it might have a negative impact in terms of wider public protection. With this in mind the Committee would ask that the performance indicator is reviewed so that a more meaningful outcome is

recorded, for example, using rolling year basis and then measuring the number of cases completed within a specific timescale.

- Page 52 of the Draft Shared Regulatory Service Business Plan 2018/19 contained details of performance measures of 'what we will measure during 2018/19'. A Member asked why two of the private sector housing indicators had a 'TBC' target and was informed that the exact detail of the performance measure was still being developed. I would be grateful if you could provide this Committee and the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee with precise details of these new performance measures once they are available.
- Members were concerned that the orange diamond stickers placed on bins in Cardiff for assisted lifts were potentially helping criminals to identify the addresses of vulnerable residents. Members of the Committee recently visited Lamby Way to look at the in cab technology used in waste collection vehicles. During the visit it was clear that waste collection details specific to individual properties (for example, if an assisted lift is required) could be programmed into the in cab technology – Members felt that if this was done then it would remove the need for an orange diamond on the bin. In addition to this I would be grateful if you could consider analysing the waste management list of assisted lifts against any data that the Shared Regulatory Service and / or police might have on reported crimes to establish if there is a link between the two data sources.
- During the meeting I asked a question about the possibility of rolling out more cold call zones across Cardiff. In my view the impact of cold call zones in Cardiff has been positive and the relative cost of rolling these out is relatively small. I would be grateful if you could provide me with an update on the practicality of rolling more of these schemes out across Cardiff.
- A Shared Regulatory Service officer made a comment during the meeting that the growing success of the service now meant that other organisations are now submitting potential new business requests to the

Shared Regulatory Service. Members thought that this was a really positive outcome that the service should build on to increase future revenue generation. With this in mind I would be grateful if you could confirm what the service will be doing in future to proactively generate additional income.

Cabinet Response to Restore Our Rivers

- The Committee thank you for the positive response to the recommendations made in the Restore Our Rivers report. During the meeting you suggested that we should consider revisiting the recommendations of the report by inviting the other partner organisations to the report back to Committee in the next municipal year. I will look into this and ask the Principal Scrutiny Officer to speak with the other partners in the next month to obtain a progress update for our July meeting. I will ensure that you are kept up to date on the matter.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

The image shows a handwritten signature in black ink. The signature is written in a cursive style and appears to read 'Ramesh Patel'. It is positioned above the printed name of the signatory.

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Andrew Gregory - Director of City Operations
- Matt Wakelam - Operational Manager, Infrastructure & Operations
- Gary Brown – Operational Manager, Assets, Engineering & Operations

- Dave Holland – Head of the Shared Regulatory Service
- Will Lane – Operational Manager, Neighbourhood Services - Shared Regulatory Service
- Helen Picton – Operational Manager, Enterprise & Specialist Services – Shared Regulatory Service
- Christina Hill – Operational Manager, Commercial Services – Shared Regulatory Service
- Davina Fiore - Director of Governance & Legal Services
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Ref: RDB/RP/PB/05.06.2018

2 August 2018

Councillor Peter Bradbury,
Cabinet Member for Culture & Leisure,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Bradbury,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 5 June 2018

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 5 June 2018. As you are aware the meeting received an item titled 'Tree Management'. The comments and observations made by Members following this item are set out in this letter.

Tree Management

- The Committee was interested in the idea of selling more tree plaques to the public by linking up with other areas such as Bereavement & Registration Services. Cardiff has a large supply of trees and a growing population who might, for example, wish to commemorate the life of someone or celebrate an event such as a wedding or a birth. With this in mind, I would be grateful if you could discuss the idea with Bereavement & Registration Services to see if it could become a new source of revenue for the Council.
- During the meeting Members were informed that it was important to use the planning process to decide on the location and type of trees to be planted in key areas of the city, for example, in new developments, alongside the highway and on Council land. It was felt that using the correct planting approach should make future tree maintenance easier.

The Committee would like assurance that the Council will continue to follow the correct planning and tree planting advice for all new trees.

- The Committee would like to note their concerned at the reduction in tree management budget from £528,000 (including a one off payment £100,000 from the financial resilience mechanism) in 2017/18 to £431,530 in 2018/19 – an overall reduction of £96,470. In addition to this the income target for 2018/19 has increased by £5,000 which, given the £15,426 income shortfall for 2017/18, means that the service will need to increase income by £20,426 in 2018/19. Members believe that keeping on top of the tree management backlog with a reduced budget and then delivering against an increased income target seems to be a very significant challenge.
- Members would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with the Tree Management emergency response phone number.
- The Committee acknowledge the challenges faced by the Tree Management Service in competing commercially with the private sector; particularly around staff retention as it is possible for properly qualified arborists to earn significantly more money outside the Council. That said, the fact that arborists are able to earn significantly more money outside the Council means that new financial opportunities exist and that the Council should do what it can to win more of this work. With this in mind, and only when existing tree management backlogs are under control, we would encourage the Tree Management Service to target existing commercial tree management opportunities across the city.
- The Committee would be grateful if you could inform them where the list of tree preservation orders is stored and how this can be accessed.
- The Committee would like to congratulate the Tree Management Service for the work that they have carried out to reduce tree related insurance claims made against the Council. The reduction from £45,333.96 in

2012/13 to £0 in 2016/17 has been impressive and illustrates that efficiencies have been achieved in this area.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Ramesh Patel', written in a cursive style.

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Neil Hanratty – Director for Economic Development
- Jon Maidment – Operational Manager – Parks, Sport & Harbour Authority
- Kevin Matthews – Senior Tree Officer
- Davina Fiore - Director of Governance & Legal Services
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

**SWYDDFA CYMORTH Y CABINET
CABINET SUPPORT OFFICE**



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087
www.cardiff.gov.uk
Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088
www.caerdydd.gov.uk

Fy Nghyf / My Ref : CM39797

Eich Cyf / Your Ref :

Dyddiad / Date: 29th June 2018

Councillor Ramesh Patel
C/O Member Services
County Hall
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Annwyl / Dear Councillor Patel

Environmental Scrutiny Committee - 5th June 2018

Thank you for your correspondence regarding the above matter.

I am pleased that the Environmental Scrutiny Committee recognises the progress made by the Shared Regulatory Service (SRS). The service remains one of the few collaborative arrangements in Wales, but is an example of what can be achieved through partnership working. I trust your Committee is content with the work being undertaken in Cardiff and that the concerns voiced by your Committee in 2014/15 have been addressed satisfactorily.

The concern expressed on the potential redundancies is shared, but the public sector is under significant pressure to operate with reduced budgets. At this stage, I am unable to quantify the scale and cost of any redundancies, but I will ensure your Committee is apprised of the final outcome later this year.

With regard to a shared Scrutiny function, this matter has been the subject of some discussion between the Scrutiny officers at the three Councils since the inception of the SRS. I understand that the Councils' newly appointed Head of democratic Services will begin work in July 2018 and I would suggest that this issue is raised with him in the first instance. The SRS Joint committee should not

ATEBWCH I / PLEASE REPLY TO :

Swyddfa Cymorth Y Cabinet / Cabinet Support Office, Ystafell / Room 518, Neuadd y Sir / County Hall, Glanfa'r Iwerydd / Atlantic Wharf , Caerdydd / Cardiff, CF10 4UW,
Ffon / Tel: (029) 2087 2598



have a role in determining how its activities and those of the officers might best be scrutinised.

The comment on the performance indicator SRS/TS/002 is apposite. Work continues to develop indicators that are more meaningful and I will keep the Committee apprised of progress. In terms of PAM13 and PAM 14, Cllr Thorne and I will ensure the CASSC are advised of performance for 2017/18 and the target setting for 2018/19.

I note your observations on the Orange Diamond regime for assisted lifting of bins. I am advised by the SRS officers that there is no immediate evidence of any correlation between the activities of rogue traders and the orange diamond scheme. If you feel that such a link exists perhaps this might be the subject of a future Scrutiny exercise involving South Wales Police, although I am unsure about the data protection implications on the accessing and sharing of this information without some clear evidence.

Creating cold calling control zones in areas where there is clear evidence of crime and disorder to protect vulnerable people in Cardiff has been successful. At the heart of the concept was a commitment to respond promptly to any calls from residents. Doing so provided reassurance to residents and sent a clear message to "door knockers" that we meant business. However, these zones were created when more resource was available. The SRS has committed to maintain coverage of the existing zones, but does not have the capacity to extend them any further; that would require additional resource.

Finally, you asked about the growth and success of our incoming generating services. Much of the detail is contained in the Business Plan that you have scrutinised. It is our intention to consolidate our income streams through the Primary Authority scheme and paid for advice services. The SRS is also undertaking a fundamental review of all its licensing activities to ensure they recover fully the cost of operating these scheme where the law permits.

I note your comments in respect of the Cabinet Response to Restore our Rivers and look forward to hearing from you in due course.

I hope the above is of assistance.

Yn gywir / Yours sincerely



Councillor / Y Cyngorydd Michael Michael
Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment
Aelod Cabinet dros Strydoedd Glân, Ailgylchu a'r Amgylchedd

Fy Nghyf / My Ref: CM40105

Dyddiad / Date: 21st August 2018

Councillor Ramesh Patel
C/O Member Services
County Hall
Atlantic Wharf
Cardiff
CF10 4UW



Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088
www.caerdydd.gov.uk
County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087
www.cardiff.gov.uk

Annwyl/Dear Ramesh

Environmental Scrutiny 5 June - Tree Management

Thank you for your letter following the meeting held on 5th June.

In response to the comments and observations as set out in the order of your letter, I can advise as follows:

- The Parks Service has a well-established Tree Memorial scheme that enables the provision of new and replacement trees throughout our Parks and Public Open Space provision. I agree that opportunities for increasing provision of such/revenue working in partnership with the Bereavement and Registration Service exist and I have requested that Officers follow this matter up.
- I concur with the view of committee members in respect of new developments, tree cover is a critical element of the public realm and brings a range of benefits. In terms of development, detailed discussions are held with the Planning, Highways and Housing Service and developers to agree:
 - Existing trees, woodland and other green infrastructure to be protected
 - Location of development in relation to retained trees through a buffer zone around existing woodland to prevent houses being built in close proximity
 - Location of new planting and the selection of suitable species and space to grow, sufficient rooting space without adverse impacts on highway infrastructure
 - Long term management of trees whether publicly or privately managed

ATEBWCH I / PLEASE REPLY TO :

Swyddfa Cymorth Y Cabinet / Cabinet Support Office, Ystafell / Room 518, Neuadd y Sir / County Hall
Glanfa'r Iwerydd / Atlantic Wharf , Caerdydd/Cardiff, CF10 4UW
Ffon / Tel: (029) 2087 2501

GWEITHIO DROS GAERDYDD, GWEITHIO DROSOCH CHI

Mae'r Cyngor yn croesawu gohebiaeth yn Gymraeg, Saesneg neu'n ddwyieithog. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu â chi yn ôl eich dewis, dim ond i chi roi gwybod i ni pa un sydd well gennych. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

WORKING FOR CARDIFF, WORKING FOR YOU

The Council welcomes correspondence in Welsh, English or bilingually. We will ensure that we communicate with you in the language of your choice, as long as you let us know which you prefer. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay.



- The key issues in relation to trees and development have been set out in the Trees and Open Space Technical Guidance Notes, which form part of the Green Infrastructure Supplementary Planning Guidance document, to provide advice to developers. I have attached this document for information.
- The financial resilience monies provided for the 17/18 financial year contributed to the reduction in the backlog of outstanding works and, as you indicated the absence of this funding and increased income target represents a significant challenge for the service. You will recall that during the meeting Officers advised that an Arboricultural Apprenticeship had been established in the Summer of 2017, with two participants, as well as contributing to the services succession plan the scheme served to add capacity to the operational team. In addition to this, arrangements for street tree maintenance had been returned from the private sector to an in-house model, also providing an opportunity to create further capacity through converting contract spend to people resource. While these measures will not fully mitigate they will, together with the implementation of a robust and prioritised inspection and maintenance regime minimise risk.
- The contact numbers for Tree Management Emergencies are:
 - During normal working / office hours 029 2044 5915
 - Outside of normal working / office hours 029 2087 2087
- The committee's comments are noted, in particular the need to address the backlog of internal works in the first instance.
- Tree Preservation Orders are managed by the Council's Planning Section who hold the relevant information. The mapping portal on the Council's website <http://iShare/cardiff.gov.uk/mycardiff.aspx>, includes information on TPO's, however the content should not be regarded as a definitive guide and any enquiries should be directed to Ed Baker, Tree Preservation Officer who can be contacted on 029 2233 0815.
- I will ensure that your remarks concerning the reduction in successful insurance claims over time are conveyed to the Tree Management team, in addition to efficiency the reduction evidences a robust inspection and maintenance regime that protects the Council from both litigation and reputational damage.

I trust that the information contained within this response is helpful and fully addresses the observations and comments made, please let me know if any clarification is required.

Yn gywir
Yours sincerely



Y Cynghorydd / Councillor Councillor Peter Bradbury
Aelod Cabinet Dros Ddiwylliant a Hamdden
Cabinet Member for Culture & Leisure